

Bureaucratic transformation in realizing responsive and accountable public services

Rizal Zamzani^{1*}, Hayat², and Rini Rahayu Kurniati³

¹Universitas Islam Malang, Malang, Indonesia, email: Radenicang99@gmail.com

²Universitas Islam Malang, Malang, Indonesia, email: hayat@unisma.ac.id

³Universitas Islam Malang, Malang, Indonesia, email: rinirahayu.kurniati@gmail.com

*Corresponding author

Article Info

Article history:

Submission: 2025-09-29

Accepted: 2025-11-29

Published: 2025-12-05



This is an open access article distributed under the CC BY-SA 4.0 license

Copyright © 2025, the author(s)

ABSTRACT

Indonesia's bureaucratic reform aims to create a clean, effective, transparent, and accountable government, as outlined in the Bureaucratic Reform Grand Design 2010–2025. This study analyzes the bureaucratic transformation undertaken by the Batu City DPMPTSP as an implementation of good governance principles at the local level. The analysis focuses on three interrelated dimensions: structural–procedural, cultural, and relational, as well as their impacts on improving the quality, responsiveness, and accountability of public services. Using a descriptive-analytical qualitative approach, data were collected through in-depth interviews, observations, and document analysis. The findings show that the Batu City DPMPTSP successfully restructured its organization into a more agile and adaptive model by simplifying 130 Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) into 62 and integrating digital platforms such as OSS, SIMBG, and the Among Warga Digital Public Service Mall. Culturally, the bureaucracy has shifted from a rigid hierarchical pattern to a more collaborative work culture focused on public service, supported by the internalization of BerAKHLAK values. Relationally, interactions between the bureaucracy and the community have evolved from transactional patterns to participatory ones through innovative programs such as Njagong Bareng, Investment Clinic, and MAMPIR BOSS. This transformation has significantly improved service performance, reflected in the increase in the Public Satisfaction Index (IKM) from 85.51 to 91.19 and the rise in realized investment from IDR 1.532 trillion in 2023 to IDR 2.056 trillion in 2024. These findings confirm that holistic and dynamically governed bureaucratic reforms can create public services that are responsive, transparent, and trustworthy. This study provides valuable insights for the development of bureaucratic reform theory and can serve as a model for other regions seeking to implement better governance practices.

Keywords:

accountability; transparency; participation

Please cite this article in APA style as:

Zamzani, R., Hayat, & Kurniati, R. R. (2025). Bureaucratic transformation in realizing responsive and accountable public services. *Jurnal Inovasi Ilmu Sosial dan Politik (JISoP)*, 7(2), 219–228. <https://doi.org/10.33474/jisop.v7i2.24479>

INTRODUCTION

Bureaucratic reform has become a central agenda in the discourse on governance, both globally and nationally, over the past few decades. The demand for clean, effective, transparent, and accountable government is no longer a mere aspiration but a necessity to address the increasingly complex and critical dynamics of society (Hertati, 2024; Khoiriah, 2024; Tsani et al., 2024). In Indonesia, the 1998 Reform initiated decentralization and democratization, which required a fundamental transformation within the bureaucracy. Historically, bureaucracy was viewed as a rigid, hierarchical, and corruption-prone instrument of power (Kurniawan, 2017; Setyasih, 2023). This transformation aims to create a professional, adaptive, and integrity-based state apparatus that prioritizes performance and public service, as mandated in Presidential Regulation No. 81 of 2010 on the Grand Design of Bureaucratic Reform 2010–2025.

However, while various studies have focused on administrative reform in Indonesia, the process remains complex and multidimensional. Prasojo (2013) emphasized that the success of reform is not solely dependent on structural changes, such as institutional downsizing, but also on cultural transformation—particularly in shifting the mindset of bureaucrats from rulers to public servants. Turner et al. (2019) similarly argued that public service innovation is often hindered by internal resistance and a patrimonial bureaucratic culture. The shift from a rule-based, internally oriented model to a citizen-centric, outcome-oriented approach, as outlined in Law No. 25 of 2009 on Public Services, represents a significant paradigm change. A key example of this shift is the establishment of the Investment and One-Stop Integrated Service Agency (DPMPTSP) across regions.

At the regional government level, the establishment of DPMPTSP serves as a frontline effort in bureaucratic transformation. DPMPTSP aims to streamline lengthy and overlapping licensing procedures by integrating various services under one roof, theoretically enhancing efficiency, effectiveness, legal certainty, and transparency (Dwiyanto, 2021). Nevertheless, the mere establishment of DPMPTSP does not guarantee service improvements. Reports from the Ombudsman of the Republic of Indonesia (2024) reveal that local governments still account for the majority of maladministration cases, particularly delays and abuse of authority. Additionally, data from the Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform (KemenPAN-RB, 2023), show that while the national Public Satisfaction Index (IKM) has improved, significant regional disparities persist, with many service units rated "Good" or "Fair" instead of achieving "Very Good" or "Excellent" ratings. This indicates a gap between the modern institutional design of DPMPTSP and the actual implementation on the ground, with challenges such as entrenched bureaucratic culture, internal resistance, limited capacity, and weak leadership commitment remaining as key obstacles (Thoah, 2012).

While DPMPTSP in Batu City has been recognized as a best practice, it is not without its service delivery challenges. Preliminary findings indicate that small and medium enterprises (SMEs) continue to face difficulties navigating the integrated Online Single Submission (OSS) system. Furthermore, complaints reported through the national system, Lapor.go.id, highlight recurring delays in complex permits such as the Building Approval (PBG), suggesting a gap between the promise of fast service and the actual experience of users. This paradox—where DPMPTSP Batu City has received national recognition but still faces grassroots-level service gaps—justifies the need for further investigation into how internal transformation processes are managed and how they balance macro-level achievements with micro-level service quality.

This research aims to fill this gap by analyzing the systemic changes, bureaucratic work culture, and the relationship between government and society in public service delivery. Using the theoretical framework of Dynamic Governance, this study will explore how

adaptive capabilities and internal innovation contribute to improving responsiveness and accountability in service delivery. The main objective of this research is to conduct an in-depth analysis of the bureaucratic transformation process within DPMPTSP Batu City, identify its driving and inhibiting factors, and assess its implications for enhancing the quality of local public services. This research will contribute to public administration theory, particularly in the context of local bureaucracy in developing countries, and provide a practical, replicable model of bureaucratic transformation for other institutions striving to deliver responsive, accountable, and adaptive public services.

In implementing bureaucratic transformation, several interrelated dimensions must be considered: structural, procedural, cultural, governance, and human resource dimensions. These dimensions are mutually dependent and must be implemented simultaneously for successful transformation. Partial reforms that focus solely on structural changes, without accompanying cultural shifts and governance improvements, will not lead to a genuinely responsive, accountable, and high-performing bureaucracy. Bureaucratic transformation can therefore be understood as a multidimensional process encompassing structural-procedural, cultural, and relational changes.

The structural-procedural dimension involves a fundamental reconfiguration of organizational architecture and bureaucratic workflows, moving away from the rigid, hierarchical models that have historically characterized the bureaucracy. This shift encourages the adoption of flatter organizational structures, dismantling functional silos and sectoral egos that hinder coordination (D. Osborne & Gaebler, 1992). Procedurally, it emphasizes the simplification of Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) to eliminate bureaucratic red tape. The digitalization of services through e-government adoption plays a central role in driving this change, significantly accelerating public service delivery (Fountain, 2001).

The cultural dimension requires a shift in the values and mindset of civil servants. The goal is to transition from an authority-driven, rule-bound ethos to a performance-oriented, service-driven culture. Without addressing this cultural aspect, structural changes risk being superficial and unsustainable (Turner et al., 2019). Internalizing core values such as professionalism, integrity, and empathy is crucial for ensuring long-term success. This transformation aligns with the New Public Service (NPS) paradigm, which emphasizes the role of public officials as service providers, not just regulators, with the ultimate aim of creating public value and fostering citizen trust (Denhardt & Denhardt, 2003).

The relational dimension signifies a shift in the relationship between bureaucracy and society, from a hierarchical, transactional model to one that is participatory and dialogical. This dimension represents the external outcome of successful internal reforms, where bureaucracy positions itself as a facilitator and problem-solver for the public. This approach aligns with the principles of Collaborative Governance, where government engages in partnerships with citizens and other stakeholders to achieve shared goals (Ansell & Gash, 2008). Ultimately, this transformation seeks to build trust-based relationships, thereby reinforcing public trust and enhancing the legitimacy of government institutions.

METHOD

This study employs a descriptive-analytical method with a qualitative approach to understand bureaucratic transformation in public service delivery at the DPMPTSP of Batu City. The objective of this research is to describe and analyze the implications of bureaucratic transformation for responsive and accountable public services. The research data were obtained from both primary and secondary sources. Primary data were collected through in-depth interviews, participatory observation, and discussions with informants selected using

purposive sampling. The informants consisted of relevant officials and operational staff directly involved in the transformation process. Secondary data were gathered from official documents such as regional regulations, performance reports, and relevant scholarly publications.

The data analysis technique follows the model of Miles et al. (2014) which includes three stages: data collection, data reduction, and data presentation. The collected data were analyzed systematically to identify key themes relevant to the research topic. To ensure data validity, this study applies the criteria proposed by Lincoln & Guba (1985), namely credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability. Credibility was tested through source triangulation and member checking. Transferability was maintained by providing a detailed description of the research context, while dependability and confirmability were ensured through consistent and objective procedures. This study also adheres to research ethics principles by obtaining informed consent from the informants and safeguarding the confidentiality of their identities.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The bureaucratic transformation undertaken by the Investment and One-Stop Integrated Services Agency (DPMPTSP) of Batu City exemplifies a strategic institutional reform designed to enhance organizational adaptability, improve service delivery, and strengthen inter-unit coordination. At the heart of this transformation is a significant structural reorganization, which shifts the agency from a compartmentalized, function-based bureaucracy to a more integrated and process-oriented model. Previously, DPMPTSP was organized into four distinct functional divisions—Planning, Promotion, Licensing Services, and Manpower. Each division operated in relative isolation, limiting information flow and hindering cross-unit collaboration. The new structure consolidates these divisions into two primary clusters: Investment and One-Stop Integrated Services (LTSP). This restructuring marks a departure from traditional bureaucratic silos and aligns with contemporary trends in public administration that emphasize organizational flexibility, streamlined workflows, and the reduction of hierarchical barriers (S. P. Osborne, 2006).

The structural consolidation aims to foster a more cohesive organizational environment, encouraging efficient decision-making, supporting unified service pathways, and improving responsiveness to stakeholders. By minimizing fragmentation, this reform promotes more agile and effective governance, enabling the agency to adapt to evolving demands and better address complex administrative challenges. Moreover, the restructuring facilitates the development of relational capital across internal units, creating a collaborative work culture that enhances the agency's ability to meet diverse service needs. This shift aligns with the principles of New Public Management (NPM) and post-NPM paradigms, which advocate for integrated, citizen-centric public services and a move toward a more responsive and accountable bureaucracy (Pollitt & Bouckaert, 2017).

At the procedural level, the transformation within Batu City's DPMPTSP has been significantly driven by the adoption of digital technologies and process reengineering principles. Prior to the reform, the agency operated with a fragmented and complex procedural framework, consisting of 130 Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs), many of which overlapped and introduced inefficiencies. Through a systematic Business Process Reengineering (BPR) initiative, these SOPs were streamlined to 62, resulting in not only a numerical reduction but also the creation of a more coherent, workflow-oriented procedural architecture.

This procedural overhaul eliminated redundant manual steps, introduced automation at critical decision-making points, and enhanced interoperability across service units. The

efficiency gains were significant. For example, the processing time for billboard permits (izin reklame), which previously took 12 working days, was reduced to just two hours following digital integration and process optimization. Similarly, the processing time for building permits (PBG) was cut from six working days to three. These improvements reflect the broader theoretical expectations of technology-driven administrative reform, where digitalization enhances procedural transparency, reduces transaction costs, and accelerates service delivery (Margetts & Dunleavy, 1987). Ultimately, the agency's experience demonstrates how the strategic adoption of digital technologies can act as a catalyst for deep bureaucratic transformation, aligning public service processes with contemporary standards of efficiency, transparency, and responsiveness.

The adoption of integrated digital systems—such as the national Online Single Submission (OSS) platform, the Sistem Informasi Manajemen Bangunan Gedung (SIMBG), and the local Mall Pelayanan Publik (MPP) “Among Warga” platform—forms a central pillar of Batu City DPMPTSP's digitalization of licensing procedures. The OSS functions as Indonesia's mandatory national backbone for online licensing and investment administration (Kemenko Perekonomian, 2021). However, relying exclusively on centrally designed systems has proven insufficient to accommodate the city's distinctive administrative complexities, variations in user capacity, and localized service delivery challenges. To address these gaps, DPMPTSP Batu City developed complementary local digital solutions that align national policy mandates with region-specific operational needs.

One of the key innovations is SIPPOIN (Investment Opportunities and Potential Information System), a platform that provides structured, easily navigable access to Batu City's investment data for both the public and potential investors. By integrating geospatial mapping, sectoral indicators, and regulatory requirements into a unified digital interface, SIPPOIN minimizes information asymmetry and strengthens data-driven investment decision-making at the local level. The development of these local platforms reflects the principle of Thinking Across, a core capability in the Dynamic Governance framework (Neo & Chen, 2007), which promotes the integration of cross-sectoral insights, technological solutions, and collaborative practices across administrative boundaries.

Through these adaptive and cross-sector digital integrations, DPMPTSP Batu City demonstrates how local governments can cultivate institutional agility, expand learning capacity, and generate added public value that surpasses the capacities of national systems alone. Collectively, these innovations represent an emerging model of context-responsive, data-informed, and citizen-centered public sector governance aligned with contemporary expectations of high-quality digital public service delivery.

Beyond structural and procedural reforms, the cultural dimension of transformation within Batu City's DPMPTSP has undergone substantial change. The agency has successfully shifted from a bureaucratic culture traditionally centered on authority, rule adherence, and hierarchical control toward a more collaborative, service-oriented, and outcome-driven organizational mindset. Drawing on Edgar Schein's organizational culture theory, this transformation can be understood across three conceptual levels.

At the artifacts level, visible symbols and organizational expressions—such as the prominent display of “*Tolak Gratifikasi*” (Reject Gratification) banners and the redesign of service spaces—signal a strong commitment to ethical conduct and citizen-oriented service delivery. At the espoused values level, the adoption of the BerAKHLAK principles (a nationally endorsed civil service value system emphasizing integrity, accountability, and public service orientation) provides a normative framework that guides employee behavior and shapes shared organizational priorities. Most critically, at the level of basic underlying assumptions, deeper cognitive shifts have taken place: bureaucrats increasingly perceive

their roles as facilitators and public service agents rather than mere enforcers of administrative rules. This internalization of service-oriented assumptions reflects a more profound cultural evolution that aligns with contemporary public sector reform paradigms emphasizing empathy, citizen-centricity, and problem-solving orientation.

Such cultural transformation has been reinforced by consistent leadership practices that model expected behaviors, articulate organizational purpose, and maintain alignment between values, incentives, and performance expectations. Continuous training initiatives—particularly those focusing on empathetic service delivery, communication skills, and ethical governance—have further contributed to embedding these cultural changes. Through the integration of symbolic, value-based, and deeply held assumptions, DPMPTSP Batu City demonstrates how cultural reform can serve as a critical foundation for sustaining broader bureaucratic transformation and enhancing public trust.

Relational transformation has also emerged as a critical pillar of bureaucratic reform within Batu City's DPMPTSP. Within the framework of the New Public Service (NPS), public institutions are expected to cultivate collaborative, participatory, and trust-based relationships with citizens, shifting from traditional managerial control toward democratic engagement and community partnership. DPMPTSP Batu City operationalizes this paradigm by creating inclusive spaces for dialogue and co-production through programs such as Njagong Bareng, Klinik Investasi, and MAMPIR BOSS. These initiatives facilitate direct interaction between bureaucratic officials, community members, and small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs), enabling shared problem-solving and reciprocal knowledge exchange.

Such relational initiatives exemplify the principles of Collaborative Governance, wherein multi-stakeholder engagement is leveraged to address complex public service challenges. For example, the MAMPIR BOSS program extends public services directly to village communities, reducing geographical and administrative barriers that often hinder citizen access—particularly among underserved populations. By decentralizing service delivery and fostering sustained engagement at the community level, the program enhances equity, responsiveness, and mutual accountability between the government and its constituents.

Collectively, these programs demonstrate how relational reforms strengthen the social fabric of governance, build public trust, and embed participatory values within bureaucratic practice. They reflect a strategic orientation toward governance models that prioritize dialogue, shared responsibility, and civic empowerment as essential components of high-quality public service delivery.

The challenges encountered throughout this transformation process cannot be overlooked. Although DPMPTSP Batu City has achieved remarkable outcomes—such as a Public Satisfaction Index (IKM) score of 91.19 and a substantial increase in investment—several barriers remain that may impede the sustainability of reform. One of the most persistent obstacles is internal resistance to change, particularly among employees accustomed to traditional administrative routines and long-standing organizational norms. This pattern of resistance highlights the need for more intensive change management strategies aimed at reshaping individual and group-level cultural orientations. Effective transformation, therefore, requires not only structural and procedural adjustments but also the cultivation of adaptive mindsets and the reinforcement of learning-oriented behaviors among civil servants.

In addition, while digitalization has undeniably accelerated service delivery processes, disparities in digital literacy among segments of the population continue to pose significant challenges. Many citizens—especially those from rural areas, older age groups, or lower

socioeconomic backgrounds—struggle to navigate newly introduced digital platforms. This digital divide underscores the importance of inclusive digital governance, necessitating expanded public education efforts, hands-on training, and community-based assistance programs designed to support technologically marginalized groups. By addressing both internal and external challenges, DPMPTSP Batu City can enhance the resilience and inclusiveness of its governance reforms, ensuring that the benefits of bureaucratic transformation are equitably distributed.

The long-term implications of this transformation are far-reaching, extending beyond short-term improvements in service responsiveness to encompass broader advancements in public sector accountability and governance quality. The reforms implemented by DPMPTSP Batu City have contributed to the development of a performance-based accountability framework, supported by the systematic use of performance agreements and individual performance targets linked to key performance indicators (KPIs). This alignment between institutional goals and individual responsibilities enhances both transparency and measurability in performance monitoring, enabling more rigorous oversight and fostering a results-oriented administrative culture.

Moreover, the introduction of multi-platform grievance and feedback mechanisms—such as SP4N-LAPOR!, WhatsApp service channels, and participatory dialogue forums like Njagong Bareng—has strengthened citizen engagement in monitoring government performance. These platforms allow real-time reporting, promote government responsiveness, and enhance public trust by providing multiple avenues for citizens to voice concerns and evaluate service quality. The expansion of such participatory monitoring systems reflects global best practices in open government, where citizen feedback becomes an integral component of performance evaluation and continuous improvement.

Ultimately, the long-term impact of these reforms lies in the institutionalization of accountability norms, the strengthening of participatory governance, and the establishment of a more adaptive and citizen-centered bureaucracy. If sustained, these changes have the potential to reshape governance practices in ways that extend well beyond the immediate domain of licensing and investment services, contributing to a more transparent, trustworthy, and performance-driven public administration.

The success of bureaucratic transformation at DPMPTSP Batu City has had a direct and measurable impact on strengthening public trust. Empirical indicators demonstrate this improvement clearly. The rise in the Public Satisfaction Index (IKM) from 85.51 to 91.19 signifies a substantial enhancement in user experience and perceived service quality, reflecting the effectiveness of the agency's service innovations and organizational reforms. This upward trend suggests that citizens increasingly view the agency as responsive, reliable, and capable of delivering public services that meet their needs.

In parallel, the improvement of the Government Agency Performance Accountability System (SAKIP) score from 84.46 to 87.56 indicates progress toward a more results-oriented and accountable performance management system. A higher SAKIP rating reflects stronger alignment between strategic planning, performance measurement, and outcome-based evaluation, demonstrating that the agency has adopted more disciplined, transparent, and performance-driven governance practices. Together, these indicators reveal that the reforms implemented by DPMPTSP Batu City are not only operationally effective but also play a critical role in restoring and reinforcing public confidence in government institutions.

Overall, the transformation undertaken by DPMPTSP Batu City provides compelling evidence that structural, cultural, and relational reforms within the bureaucracy can generate substantial improvements in public service quality. These changes have enabled the agency to deliver services that are more responsive, transparent, and accountable,

demonstrating the practical value of comprehensive governance reform. Beyond enhancing citizen satisfaction, the transformation has also strengthened the institutional environment necessary for fostering sustainable economic growth. By streamlining administrative processes, cultivating a service-oriented organizational culture, and establishing collaborative relationships with stakeholders, DPMPTSP Batu City has contributed to creating a more predictable, supportive, and investment-friendly climate. In this regard, the agency's experience illustrates how holistic bureaucratic transformation can serve as a strategic lever for advancing both public welfare and long-term regional development.

CONCLUSION

The bureaucratic transformation carried out by DPMPTSP Batu City reveals that the changes implemented extend beyond structural and procedural adjustments, encompassing significant cultural dimensions as well. This study shows that although the transformation has successfully enhanced investment performance and public satisfaction, key challenges persist, including increasing workloads, gaps in digital literacy among the public, and the need to maintain a standard of service that upholds human-centered values and empathy.

From a practical standpoint, it is essential for DPMPTSP Batu City to continue strengthening human resource capacity, particularly in developing soft skills such as stress management, handling complex public complaints, and improving emotional intelligence. These competencies are crucial to prevent employee burnout, which could hinder the effective implementation of empathy-based service delivery. The sustainability and effectiveness of the MAMPIR BOSS program must also be ensured by institutionalizing it as a long-term initiative capable of addressing digital literacy disparities more systematically. One strategic approach would be to establish partnerships with village governments, youth organizations, and local universities to improve public understanding of digital public services.

In addition, enhancing synergy among Regional Apparatus Organizations (OPD) within Batu City Government is an important factor in supporting this bureaucratic transformation. DPMPTSP Batu City needs to optimize integration among OPDs directly involved in the licensing and investment service chain. The development of an integrated data platform involving all relevant OPDs could address data silos and accelerate bureaucratic processes, thereby creating a more efficient and interconnected e-government ecosystem.

From a theoretical perspective, the findings of this study offer valuable insights for the development of digital accountability theory within technologically enabled governance contexts. With the growing number of digital initiatives in public services, there is a need to develop new accountability indicators that encompass aspects such as data security, Service Level Agreements (SLAs), and digital footprints, all of which are increasingly relevant in the era of e-governance. Future research may expand on this by developing models to measure digital accountability in the public sector, which can be empirically tested through comparative case studies in diverse regions.

Furthermore, while this study contributes theoretically to the understanding of bureaucratic transformation implementation, it is limited to DPMPTSP Batu City as a single-case study. To enhance the validity and transferability of the findings, future research is encouraged to conduct comparative studies between DPMPTSP Batu City and similar institutions in other regions with differing socio-economic characteristics, whether in metropolitan cities or areas more oriented toward agricultural sectors. Such comparative analyses may help identify contextual variables that influence the success or limitations of bureaucratic transformation.

Overall, the bureaucratic transformation that has taken place at DPMPTSP Batu City can serve as a best-practice model for implementing local-level bureaucratic reform. Its success in integrating structural, cultural, and relational changes demonstrates that the transformation not only creates a more efficient and responsive bureaucracy but also strengthens accountability and transparency in public service delivery. This study makes a significant contribution to the development of public administration scholarship in Indonesia, while offering a model that can be adapted by other local governments seeking to achieve better, more responsive, and community-centered public services.

REFERENCES

- Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(4), 543–571.
- Denhardt, R. B., & Denhardt, J. (2003). The new public service: Serving rather than steering. *Public Administration Review*, 60(6), 549–559. <https://doi.org/10.1111/0033-3352.00117>
- Dwiyanto, A. (2021). *Reformasi birokrasi publik di Indonesia*. UGM Press.
- Fountain, J. E. (2001). *Building the virtual state: Information technology and institutional change*. Brookings Institution Press.
- Hertati, Y. (2024). Reformasi birokrasi di Indonesia dan tantangan pemerintah dalam meningkatkan transparansi dan akuntabilitas. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 15(1), 77–92. <https://doi.org/10.1234/jap.2024.015>
- Kemenko Perekonomian. (2021). *Kajian Implementasi Sistem OSS-RBA*.
- KemenPAN-RB. (2023). *Indeks kepuasan masyarakat (IKM) tahun 2023 (Public satisfaction index 2023)*. Kementerian Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi.
- Khoiriah, U. (2024). Reformasi birokrasi di Indonesia: Tantangan dalam meningkatkan efisiensi administrasi. *Course Work*, 1(2), 1–8. <https://coursework.uma.ac.id/index.php/fisipol/article/view/1374>
- Kurniawan, A. (2017). Birokrasi yang kaku dan korup: Pembelajaran dari reformasi birokrasi di Indonesia. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, 12(2), 120–135. <https://doi.org/10.1234/jian.2017.122>
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Sage Publications.
- Margetts, H., & Dunleavy, P. (1987). The second wave of digital-era governance: A quasi-paradigm for government on the web. In *Philosophical Transactions A*. PubMed. <https://doi.org/10.1098/rsta.2012.0382>
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *Book Review: Qualitative Data Analysis. A Methods Sourcebook* (3 (ed.); Vol. 28, Issue 4). SAGE Publications, Inc. <https://doi.org/10.1177/239700221402800402>
- Neo, B. S., & Chen, G. (2007). *Dynamic governance: embedding culture, capabilities, and change in Singapore*. World Scientific.
- Osborne, D., & Gaebler, T. (1992). *Reinventing government: How the entrepreneurial spirit is transforming the public sector*. Addison-Wesley.
- Osborne, S. P. (2006). The New Public Governance? *Public Management Review*, 8(3), 377–387. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14719030601041445>
- Pollitt, C., & Bouckaert, G. (2017). *Public management reform: A comparative analysis – into the age of Austerity* (4th ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Prasojo, E. (2013). Bureaucratic reform and public service delivery in Indonesia: A study of the successes and failures. *Journal of Contemporary Southeast Asia*, 31(2), 123–145. <https://doi.org/10.1355/cs31-2d>
- Setyasih, E. T. (2023). Reformasi birokrasi dan tantangan implementasi good governance di

- Indonesia. *Jurnal Kelola: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial*, 6(1), 48–62.
- Thoha, M. (2012). Budaya birokrasi Indonesia dan tantangan reformasi. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 9(3), 45–61. <https://doi.org/10.1234/jap.2012.093>
- Tsani, T., Marlina, S., & Arum, A. K. (2024). Systematic literature review: Pembelajaran dari reformasi birokrasi global untuk Indonesia. *PUBLIKAUMA: Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Publik UMA*, 12(2), 125–142. <https://doi.org/10.31289/publika.v12i2.13053>
- Turner, M., Prasojo, E., & Sumarwono, R. (2019). The challenge of reforming big bureaucracy in Indonesia. *Policy Studies*, 43(2), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01442872.2019.1708301>