

Effectiveness of E-Government Implementation as a Community Administration Service Media Case Study: Kelurahan Tunjung Tirto, Singosari District, Malang Regency

Dwi Shinta¹

¹ Universitas Islam Malang, Indonesia

E-mail: 22101091128@unisma.ac.id

Yusron Hamid Elgifari²

² Universitas Islam Malang, Indonesia

E-mail: 22101091140@unisma.ac.id

M.Sytullah Imran Iskandar³

³ Universitas Islam Malang, Indonesia

E-mail: 22101091146@unisma.ac.id

Zainal Abidin⁴

⁴ Universitas Islam Malang, Indonesia

E-mail: 22101091149@unisma.ac.id

Rahdian Subakti⁵

⁵ Universitas Islam Malang, Indonesia

E-mail: 22101091135@unisma.ac.id

Stela Eka Listiani⁶

⁶ Universitas Islam Malang, Indonesia

E-mail: 22101091154@unisma.ac.id

Brenda Gita Cahyani⁷

⁷ Universitas Islam Malang, Indonesia

E-mail: 22101091162@unisma.ac.id

Article History:

Received: 8 February 2022

Revised: 28 February 2022

Accepted: 13 March 2022

Abstract: *Advancements in technology and information in the current era are rapidly increasing and have influenced various aspects of daily life, including administrative processes and public services. One of the*

Keywords: e-government, public services, administrative services, implementation effectiveness

positive impacts is the implementation of e-government, which enables the public to independently access and manage administrative and civil-service matters. One area that has adopted this system is Tunjung Tirto Village, located in Singosari District, Malang Regency. This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of e-government implementation as a medium for public administrative services in Tunjung Tirto Village. The research method employed was qualitative, using interviews with government officials at the village office and community members, supported by literature studies from relevant journals and books. The results indicate that the implementation of the e-government program in Tunjung Tirto Village has not been fully effective. Several obstacles were identified, including internal factors related to users and external factors originating outside the user environment. It is expected that e-government can be optimized, considering that its benefits will be experienced by both the government and the community. Furthermore, effective implementation may serve as a model for other regions to maximize the benefits of e-government.

INTRODUCTION

Information and communication technology (ICT) has continued to advance rapidly and is widely utilized in daily life, including in government systems. Within public administration, the application of ICT is reflected through the implementation of electronic government, commonly known as e-Government. According to Risnandar (2014), e-Government represents a new paradigm in governance aimed at creating transparency regarding public information.

The use of ICT is implemented not only by the central government but also by regional governments, including the Malang Regency Government. To improve public service quality, Tunjung Tirto Village, Singosari District, Malang Regency has introduced innovations by utilizing existing technology. E-Government is intended to enhance community-oriented public services. According to Mary Maureen Brown (in Deddy Mulyadi, 2016), e-Government refers to the use of technological advancements, especially web-based internet applications, to improve government access to citizens, business partners, employees, and other governmental institutions. However, based on the 2012 Ranking of e-Government in Indonesia (PeGI), only 6 out of 497 districts/cities were considered successful in implementing e-Government (Ministry of Home Affairs, 2012). At the provincial level, implementation also received low scores (Ministry of Home Affairs, 2009). Internationally, the 2012 Waseda e-Government survey placed Indonesia at rank 33 out of 55 countries, dropping further to rank 40 in 2013. Likewise, the 2012 United Nations e-Government ranking placed Indonesia 7th out of 11 ASEAN countries,

far behind Malaysia and Vietnam. These data indicate that e-Government implementation in Indonesia remains suboptimal, often fulfilling policy requirements without significant quality improvements.

Nonetheless, some regions have successfully implemented e-Government. Two important requirements for effective e-Government are availability and accessibility (Sami, 2012). First, services must be available 24/7, enabling users to access public services at any time. Second, accessibility must be ensured; if services cannot be accessed, e-Government implementation is considered unsuccessful. Although Presidential Instruction No. 3 of 2003 has encouraged the development of e-Government, most government institutions remain at early development stages, focusing merely on building informational websites. Research by the Ministry of Communication and Information (2004) showed that 10% of 224 government websites were inaccessible, reflecting limited implementation progress. Further, Hendriawan (2008) reported that 16% of 402 local government websites were inaccessible.

Malang Regency is among the regions that have adopted e-Government at the village level, including in Tunjung Tirto Village. This program aims to facilitate administrative processes and improve public service delivery. According to Ni Nyoman Dewi Pancarani (in Oktavya, 2015), factors supporting successful e-Government include human resource readiness, participation, budget availability, security, and infrastructure. If these supporting factors are adequately fulfilled, public administrative services—especially in Tunjung Tirto Village—can become more effective and efficient.

Previous studies have explored e-Government implementation. Furuholt and Wahid identified six critical success factors (CSFs) in Sragen: strong leadership, stakeholder involvement, human resource preparation, gradual implementation, partnership building, and routine evaluation (Furuholt, 2008). Similarly, Junaidi (2011) found four dominant success factors: political will, master plan, change management, and community participation. Research in Bantul, Yogyakarta emphasized strong leadership and good governance as key success elements (Dewi, 2011). Studies by Faizah & Sensuse in four districts/cities highlighted policy, institutional structure, and leadership as the main success factors (Faizah et al., 2009). Napitupulu (2014) identified 54 CSFs related to e-Government implementation.

E-Government in Tunjung Tirto Village was implemented in September 2019, during the early COVID-19 period. The Malang Regency Government has actively supported its implementation by conducting outreach to various community groups. e-Government is expected to improve bureaucratic efficiency and minimize resource use, benefiting both the government and society.

Given this context, the present study focuses on analyzing the effectiveness of e-Government implementation in Tunjung Tirto Village, Singosari District, Malang Regency, as well as the obstacles encountered in its operation.

METHOD

This study employs a qualitative descriptive approach. This method was selected to obtain a detailed and comprehensive understanding of the implementation and effectiveness of e-Government services in the selected research area (Neuman, 2007). Tunjung Tirto Village, Singosari District, Malang Regency, was chosen as the case study location because it is one of the regions that has implemented the e-Government system.

Data were collected through interviews and literature review. Interviews were conducted with government employees at the Tunjung Tirto Village Office who were directly involved in or responsible for operating the e-Government system. Respondents were selected based on their roles and responsibilities to ensure that the information gathered was relevant and valid. In addition, interviews were conducted with community members in Tunjung Tirto Village, both those who had used e-Government services and those who had not, in order to obtain a broader understanding of community perceptions and experiences.

The literature review consisted of examining relevant journals, books, and official government websites related to e-Government implementation. This secondary data supported the primary findings obtained through interviews and provided theoretical and contextual foundations for the study.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The Effectiveness of E-Government Implementation as a Medium for Public Administration Services in Tunjung Tirto Village, Singosari District, Malang Regency

Effectiveness refers to the comparison between planned targets and achieved results. A program is considered effective when its outcomes closely align with the predetermined objectives. Therefore, effectiveness must be measured in accordance with the goals set. In this study, the effectiveness of the e-Government program is assessed using the indicators proposed by Sutrisno in Ramadhan (2018), namely: program understanding, target accuracy, timeliness, goal achievement, and real change.

The following analysis discusses each indicator based on findings from Tunjung Tirto Village, Singosari District, Malang Regency:

a. Program Understanding

Program understanding refers to the extent to which the community and relevant stakeholders comprehend the e-Government program being implemented. According to Sutrisno in Ramadhan (2018), this indicator evaluates how well the program is recognized and understood by target groups. Based on interviews with stakeholders and community members, it can be concluded that the level of understanding of the e-Government program within the village office is relatively good. Employees are able to understand the program and its functions. From the community perspective, 7 out of 10 respondents stated that they were aware of and understood the program, although many

had not yet utilized it for various reasons. Thus, in terms of program understanding, the e-Government program in Tunjung Tirto Village can be categorized as effective from both government and community perspectives, although community usage remains suboptimal.

b. Target Accuracy

Target accuracy refers to the suitability between the program's goals and its intended recipients. In this case, the main target of e-Government implementation is the community as beneficiaries of improved public services. Interviews revealed that the e-Government program has not been fully effective in reaching its intended target. The primary reason is the lack of comprehensive socialization conducted by the village office. Information regarding the program has not been evenly or consistently delivered to the broader community. Socialization activities are often incidental, taking place only during certain events. Consequently, many residents remain uninformed or less motivated to utilize the program, making the targeting aspect of the program ineffective.

c. Timeliness

Timeliness refers to the extent to which the implementation of e-Government affects the speed of public service delivery. Ideally, the program should facilitate faster and more efficient administrative processes. Interviews showed that the program does help the village office reduce service time when the system functions properly. However, from the community's perspective, timeliness is not consistently achieved. Difficulties in accessing the system often result in longer processing times. When the system is accessible, letter processing becomes faster; however, if access is difficult, services take longer, discouraging community participation. Thus, timeliness is considered partially effective, benefiting internal administrative processes but not consistently benefiting community users.

d. Goal Achievement

This indicator evaluates whether the e-Government program has achieved the objectives set, including improving service efficiency, easing administrative procedures, and minimizing time and costs. Findings indicate that the goal achievement of the e-Government program remains limited. Most residents still choose to handle administration manually rather than utilizing the online system. Since program goals are only considered met when users predominantly rely on the e-Government platform, the low utilization rate indicates that goals have not been fully accomplished. Thus, the e-Government program has not effectively achieved its intended objectives.

e. Real Change

Real change measures whether the implementation of the e-Government program has produced noticeable impacts or improvements in public services. This includes whether the community feels any tangible benefits after its implementation. Interviews suggest that neither the community nor the government has perceived significant changes

in public service delivery following the program's implementation. Letter processing times remain relatively unchanged, and most residents prefer to handle administrative needs manually rather than using the system. Therefore, it can be concluded that the implementation of the e-Government program has not generated significant real change in public services in Tunjung Tirto Village.

Barriers to the Effectiveness of E-Government Implementation as a Medium for Public Administration Services in Tunjung Tirto Village, Singosari District, Malang Regency

The introduction of e-Government in Indonesia has encouraged government agencies at various administrative levels to digitize public service processes. This development is reflected in the increasing number of official websites established by provincial, district, and municipal governments. According to the Ministry of Communication and Information, there are currently 472 local government websites in Indonesia. However, despite this growth, many platforms remain suboptimal in function and content. Several websites feature outdated information, minimal updates, and monotonous layouts, resulting in low interaction from users. Even when active, many websites serve merely as “decoration” rather than functioning platforms that support effective public service delivery.

Consequently, although many government institutions claim to have implemented e-Government, most remain at the “web presence” stage. As a result, public services—such as ID card processing, birth certificate requests, and family card applications—still require in-person visits, sometimes involving intermediaries (brokers). This situation is inefficient, inconvenient, and costly for citizens.

The primary purpose of e-Government is to facilitate effective and efficient public service delivery. This vision also underlies the implementation of e-Government in Malang Regency, including Tunjung Tirto Village, Singosari District. Nevertheless, several obstacles continue to hinder its effectiveness. According to Hansen and Mowen in Haksama (2016), such barriers may be categorized into internal and external barriers.

Based on interviews, the obstacles to e-Government implementation in Tunjung Tirto Village are described below:

a. Internal Barriers

Internal barriers refer to challenges originating from within the implementing organization—in this case, the village government. The main internal issue concerns the lack of capacity and optimization of human resources (HR). Many village officials are not fully familiar with the application or operation of the e-Government system, leading to limited ability to manage and utilize the platform effectively. As a result, most administrative processes involving the e-Government system are carried out only by the appointed office operator. Citizens are often represented by this operator instead of accessing the system independently, indicating low digital participation and limited

resource support within the government apparatus.

b. External Barriers

External barriers are challenges originating outside the implementing organization, particularly from the community. The main external barrier identified is the low level of community satisfaction with the e-Government program. This dissatisfaction stems largely from insufficient outreach and socialization regarding system functions and benefits. Due to this limited awareness, many residents are reluctant or unable to use the e-Government services provided. Consequently, community engagement remains low, and traditional manual procedures are still widely preferred.

Efforts to Overcome Barriers

To address these challenges, local authorities in Tunjung Tirto Village have initiated efforts to improve program effectiveness. Based on interviews, the primary step taken is to increase public outreach and education regarding the e-Government system. This aims to enhance community awareness and understanding, encouraging broader utilization. It is expected that improved socialization efforts will support smoother implementation and greater effectiveness of e-Government services in the village.

CONCLUSION

Tunjung Tirto Village, Singosari District, Malang Regency, as one of the governmental units that has implemented the e-Government program as a form of public service innovation, has demonstrated progress; however, its implementation has not yet reached an effective level. This is indicated by several effectiveness indicators that have not been fully achieved. Although the e-Government program has assisted government agencies—particularly in document handling—residents of Tunjung Tirto Village have not yet experienced optimal benefits as users of the system.

Several obstacles hinder the effective implementation of e-Government in Tunjung Tirto Village. First, public dissatisfaction persists regarding administrative services delivered through the system. Second, external factors such as unstable network connectivity and weather conditions disrupt the operation of e-Government services. These challenges have caused many users to revert to manual administrative procedures, reflected in the declining number of e-Government users since the program was launched.

To address these issues, the Tunjung Tirto Village government has undertaken efforts to intensify community outreach. This includes providing dedicated time for socialization activities aimed at reintroducing the objectives and benefits of the e-Government program, in hopes of encouraging greater public participation and enhancing overall program effectiveness.

References

- Agustino, Leo. (2012). *Fundamentals of Public Policy*. Bandung: Alfabeta. Arikunto.
- Ambar Sari Dewi, (2011), *The Role of Local eGovernment in Bureaucratic Reform in Terong, Bantul District, Internetworking Indonesia Journal*, Vol. 3, No. 2, 49-56
- Yogyakarta Province, Indonesia Darmawan Napitupulu, 2014. The Critical Success Factors Study for e-Government Implementation, *International Journal of Computer Application*, Vol 89, No. 16, March 2014
- Deliza Henny, 2006.
- Budi, Winarno. (2012). *Public Policy: Theory, Process and Case Studies*. Yogyakarta: CAPS
- Deddy Mulyadi, D. (2016). *Public Administration for Public Service*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Depdagri, (2009), *Ranking of e-Government in Indonesia*, Accessed from www.depdagri.go.id
- Depkominfo. (2004). *Local Government Website Condition*. Accessed from <http://www.depkominfo.go.id>
- Faizah N., Dana Indra S, 2009. *Success Factors*
- Kementerian Dalam Negeri Republik Indonesia. (2012). *Peringkat e-Government Indonesia (PeGI) 2012*.
- Kementerian Komunikasi dan Informatika. (2004). *Laporan penelitian website pemerintah Indonesia*.
- Ministry of Communication and Information. (n.d.). *Data situs Pemerintah Daerah*.